

TREASURY OF THE EYE OF THE TRUE DHARMA

BOOK 42

Talking of the Mind, Talking of the Nature

Shōbōgenzō Sesshin sesshō

正法眼藏說心說性

NOTES

1. A story, quoted here in Chinese, that also appears as case 62 in Dōgen's *shinji* 真字 *Shōbōgenzō* (DZZ.5:158); probably taken from the *Zongmen tongyao ji* 宗門統要集 (*Zengaku tenseki sōkan* 禪學典籍叢刊 [ZTS] 1:159b); see also *Liendeng huiyao* 聯燈會要 (ZZ.136:384d).

“The Chan Master Shenshan Sengmi” (*Shinzan Sōmitsu Zenji* 神山僧密禪師): Tang-dynasty figure (dates unknown); disciple of Yunyan Tansheng 雲巖曇晟; his biographical notice occurs at *Jingde chuandeng lu* 景德傳燈錄, T.51:323b.

“The Great Master Dongshan Wuben” (*Tōzan Gohon Daishi* 洞山悟本大師): Title of Dongshan Liangjie 洞山良价 (807-869), founder of the Caodong tradition of Chan; also a disciple of Yunyan Tansheng; his biography appears at *Jingde chuandeng lu*, T.51:321b.

“Cloister beside the road” (*bō in* 傍院): Supplying *ro* 路 from the Chinese versions of the story, which gives *lu bang yuan* 路傍院.

“Inside” (*rimen* 裏面): The element *men*, while here having little semantic function in the Chinese, has the etymological sense, “face” or “surface” — a sense Dōgen will take advantage of in his commentary below (see Note 21, “inside or surface”).

“There's someone” (*unin* 有人): Or simply “someone”; Dōgen will play with the predicate-nominative syntax of the Chinese idiom in his commentary (see Note 21, “there's someone and someone's there”).

“Talking of the mind, talking of the nature” (*sesshin sesshō* 説心説性): A famous phrase that gets picked up in other Chan texts. “Mind” and “nature” can be understood either as two topics (the mind and its true nature) or as two elements of a single binome, *shinshō*, “the nature of the mind.” The predicate, *setsu*, taken here simply as “to talk about,” also has the meanings, “to explain,” “to expound,” “to teach,” “to preach.” Hence, especially in the setting of the cloister here, Dongshan’s remark could be read, “There’s someone teaching the mind and teaching the nature.”

“Elder brother Sengmi” (*Sōmitsu sihaku* 僧密師伯): The term *shihaku*, translated here as “elder brother,” refers to the fact that Shenshan Sengmi and Dongshan Liangjie were fellow disciples of Yunyan Tansheng and, hence, are “dharma brothers.” While the Chinese sources (and the *shinji Shōbōgenzō*) identify Sengmi simply as “the master” (*shih* 師), Dōgen introduces here the honorific term that Liangjie will use in reference to Sengmi. Commentators often parse this binome as “the master’s (i.e., Liangjie’s) elder brother” and treat it as an honorific among Dongshan’s followers; this interpretation may work for Dōgen’s use in this line, but it hardly fits with Liangjie’s own use in the next line.

“He’s immediately doomed” (*jiki toku kyoshi jūbun* 直得去死十分): The expression *kyoshi jūbun* (“totally dead”), translated here as “doomed,” is an idiom occurring in Chan texts with a sense something like “is as good as dead”; in his commentary below, Dōgen will play with the element *jūbun* (“fully,” “totally,”), which has a literal sense, “ten parts” (or “a hundred percent”). The grammatical subject is unexpressed here; it is usually taken as the “someone” (*unin* 有人) who is “talking of the mind and talking of the nature,” but it could be Dongshan himself.

“In death, he lives” (*shi chū toku katsu* 死中得活): Or “he revives,” “he survives.” Perhaps derived from the idiom, “to seek life in death” (*sichung qiu huo* 死中求活) — i.e., to hope to survive a desperate situation.

2. A series of references to the spiritual career of the buddha, ending with a comment from one of the ancestors. The hyperbolic praise of the expression,

“talking of the mind and talking of the nature,” here and throughout this fascicle is in stark contrast to Dōgen’s earlier statement, in his *Shōbōgenzō sansui kyō* 山水經 (from 1240), that “talking of the mind and talking of the nature is something not approved by the buddhas and ancestors” (DZZ.1:318).

“Turning the wheel of the wondrous dharma” (*ten myōhō rin* 轉妙法輪): I.e., the teaching of the buddha dharma.

“Production of the thought and cultivation of the practice” (*hosshin shugyō* 發心修行): I.e., the bodhisattva’s aspiration for unsurpassed, perfect bodhi and the training to attain it.

“The great earth and sentient beings simultaneously achieved the way” (*daichi ujō dōji jōdō* 大地有情同時成道): A reference to the Buddha’s enlightenment under the bodhi tree. The expression, which appears in several of Dōgen’s texts, is from a line that he will quote in his *Hotsu bodai shin* 發菩提心 fascicle: “The Buddha Śākyamuni said, “When the morning star appeared, I, along with the great earth and sentient beings, simultaneously achieved the way.” (DZZ.2:164; also quoted at *Eihei kōroku* 永平廣錄 1, *jōdō* 上堂 37, DZZ.3:28.) Although the line appears in Chinese Chan texts from this period (see, e.g. *Xu deng lu* 續燈錄, ZZ.136:36b17-18), it has not been located in any extant sutra. The translation here follows the usual reading of *daichi ujō* as a compound subject; the phrase could also be read, “sentient beings of the great earth.”

“All living beings lack buddha nature” (*issai shujō mu busshō* 一切衆生無佛性): A saying attributed to Gueishan Lingyu 潯山靈祐 (771-853); see *shinji Shōbōgenzō*, case 115 (DZZ.5:188); *Zongmen tongyao ji* (ZTS.1:88b2); *Liandeng huiyao* 聯燈會要 (ZZ.136: 271c10). Often interpreted to mean that the buddha nature is “empty”; i.e., not some thing that sentient beings have. Perhaps intended here as what we might call the reverse of the relationship between buddha and sentient beings given in the preceding clause.

3. A series of references to the history of the ancestors, ending with the teaching activities of the Chan masters.

“Holding up a flower and blinking” (*nenge shunmoku* 拈華瞬目); “breaking into a smile” (*hagan mishō* 破顏微笑): Reference to the famous founding story of Zen, in which the Buddha held up a flower on Vulture Peak, his disciple Mahākāśyapa smiled, and the Buddha recognized him as the heir to his “treasury of the eye of the true dharma.” (See *shinji Shōbōgenzō*, case 253 [DZZ.5:258]. Though this famous story appears throughout the Chinese Chan literature, Dōgen’s version of it does not seem quite to match any extant text.)

“Making a bow and standing there” (*raihai ei ni ryū* 禮拜依位而立): A reference to the account of Huike’s 惠可 recognition as the Second Ancestor of Chinese Chan. Bodhidharma asked four of his disciples for expressions of their understanding of his teaching. Huiko’s response was simply to bow and stand there, whereupon Bodhidharma declared, “You’ve got my marrow.” (See *shinji Shōbōgenzō*, case 201 [DZZ.5:230]; *Jingde chuandeng lu* [T.51:219c4-5].)

“The ancestral master entering the Liang” (*soshi nyūryō* 祖師入梁): A reference to the Twenty-eighth Ancestor, Bodhidharma’s, bringing the Zen tradition to China from India. The Liang dynasty ruled southern China during the period 502-557; Bodhidharma is said to have had an interview with the founder of the dynasty, Wudi (r. 502-550).

“Transmitting the robe in the middle of the night” (*yahan den’e* 夜半傳衣): A reference to the ascension of the Sixth Ancestor, Huineng 惠能, who is said to have received the robe of Bodhidharma from the Fifth Ancestor, Hungren 弘忍, in secret during the night.

“Taking up the staff” (*nen shujō* 拈拄杖); “laying down the whisk” (*ō hossu* 橫拂子): Gestures of the Chan masters associated with their teaching. The staff (*shujō*) is a walking stick, often carried by the master when he “ascends the hall” (*jōdō* 上堂; i.e., gives a formal lecture); the whisk (*hossu*) is a ceremonial fly-whisk, often held by the master during lectures and other rituals.

4. “The ordinary” (*heijō* 平常): Likely an allusion to the famous saying of Nanquan Puyuan 南泉普願 (748-834): “The ordinary mind is the way” (*bianchang shin shi dao* 平常心是道). (*Shinji Shōbōgenzō*, case 19 [DZZ.5:134]; *Jingde chuandeng lu* [T.51:276c15].)

“Fences, walls, tiles and pebbles” (*shō heki ga ryaku* 牆壁瓦礫): A fairly common definition of the “old buddha mind” (*kobutsu shin* 古佛心), first attributed to Nanyang Huizhong 南陽慧忠 (d. 775).

“The realization of the principle” (*dōri genjō* 道理現成): An unusual locution, found occasionally in Dōgen’s writings, probably meaning something like, “the expression (or appearance) of the truth that . . .”

“When the mind arises, the various dharmas arise” (*shin shō shuju hō shō* 心生種種法生); “when the mind ceases, the various dharmas cease” (*shin metsu shuju hō metsu* 心滅種種法滅): Likely from the *Dasheng qishin lun* 大乘起信論 (T.32:577b22).

5. “Mediocre types” (*yōru* 庸流): One of Dōgen’s favorite terms for those with whose views of Zen he disagrees.

“Discussing the dark and discussing the subtle” (*dan gen dan myō* 談玄談妙): The binome *genmyō* (“dark and subtle” or “deep and marvelous”) is a common one in Buddhist texts, and in Chinese writing more generally, for what is profound and mysterious. Here, a reference to the words of Dahui that Dōgen will quote in the next section.

“They think of “talking of the mind and talking of the nature” as “talking of the mind and talking of the nature” (*sesshin sesshō wo sesshin sesshō to omou* 説心説性を説心説性とおもふ): Usually interpreted to mean that they take “talking of the mind and talking of nature” is some literal sense of “talking.”

“They have not been critical of the passage and obstructions of the great way” (*daidō no tsūsoku wo hihan sezarū* 大道の通塞を批判せざる): Usually interpreted to mean that they have not thought critically about what is and is not integral to the great way. “Passage and obstruction” here translates *tsūsoku*, meaning that a road or way is “open or blocked”; often carrying the idiomatic sense of “affairs going smoothly or not.”

6. This passage is given in Japanese and in fact does not seem to be a direct quotation from any extant text. The writings of Dahui do contain several passages in which he is critical of the practices of “talking of the mind and talking of the nature” (*shuo xin shuo xing* 說心說性) and “talking of the dark and talking of the subtle” (*shuo xuan shuo miao* 說玄說妙). (See, e.g., *Dahui yulu*, T.47:830c5; 927b26.)

“Of late” (*kōrai* 後來): Ordinarily an adverb meaning “subsequently,” “thereafter,” etc., this term seems to appear in Dōgen’s writings exclusively in dismissive references to what is merely recent (cf. the more “classic” *korai* 古來).

“Zonggao, the Chan Master Dahui of Jingshan” (*Kinzan Daie Zenji Sōkō* 徑山大慧禪師宗杲): Dahui Zonggao (1089-1163), a leading figure in the Linji lineage during the Southern Song; his biography occurs at *Liendeng huiyao* (ZZ.136:351d). The *Shōbōgenzō* contains several criticisms of him; see especially *Jishō zanmai* 自證三昧.

“The two do not arise” (*nisō fushō* 二相不生): Literally, “the two characteristics do not arise.” Could be understood as a reference either to the two pairs, “mind and nature” and “dark and subtle,” or to the two members of each pair.

“Verify and accord” (*shōkai* 證契): A tentative translation of a term occurring a number of times in Dōgen’s writings but more rarely in the Chinese Chan texts. Both elements of the binome are common Chan terms, with legal connotations, for spiritual understanding: *shō* (“verify”) has the sense of “bearing witness” to something; *kai* (“accord”) has the sense of “agreeing”

with someone or something (from the nominal usage as “tally,” “contract” or “agreement”). The translation here treats both elements as verbs, but interpretations of Dōgen’s use of *shōkai* regularly treat it as a subject-predicate compound, meaning one’s “verification accords” (often, with that of one’s master); the relationship could also be understood as a predicate-object, meaning that one “verifies the accord” (with the teachings or one’s master). I have not encountered this term in Dahui’s writings, though he does use the two elements in reverse: *qisheng* 契證, perhaps to be understood, “to accord with the verification.”

7. “The pale yellow silk of the buddhas and ancestors” (*busso no kenshō* 佛祖の縑緗); “the monarchical line of the buddhas and ancestors” (*busso no reppeki* [or *retsuheki*] 佛祖の列辟): “Pale yellow silk” (*kenshō*) refers to the silk threads used to decorate books; hence, as a synecdoche, “texts.” “Monarchical line” (*reppeki*) is usually taken as a reference the Chan lineage; some interpret *heki* 辟 here as “law”; others take it as a substitute for the homonymous graph *heki* 璧 (“jade”).

“The mind is consideration, knowledge, thought, and perception” (*shin wa . . . ryo chi nen kaku nari* 心は慮知念覺なり); “consideration, knowledge, thought, and perception are also the mind” (*ryo chi nen kaku mo shin naru* 慮知念覺も心なる): The four terms translated here as “consideration, knowledge, thought, and perception” represent a list, appearing with some frequency in the *Shōbōgenzō*, that is generally understood to indicate the full range of mental activities. The point here appears to be that Dahui thinks that the mind has mental activities but doesn’t understand these activities are themselves the mind.

“Such a nature” (*nyoze shō* 如是性): The adjective “such” (*nyoze*) here could refer simply to the preceding “buddha nature” and “dharma nature,” but it also suggests the famous list of ten “suchnesses” (*jū nyoze* 十如是), appearing in Kumārajīva’s translation of the *Lotus Sutra*, one of which is “such a nature.” (*Miaofa lianhua jing* 妙法蓮華經, T.9:5c.)

“Biased view” (*hekiken* 辟見): Reading *heki* 辟 (Morohashi 38642) here as *heki* 僻 (Morohashi 1166).

8. “Skin, flesh, bones, and marrow” (*hi niku kotsu zui* 皮肉骨髓): An expression used throughout Dōgen’s writings for the essence or entirety of what is transmitted in the Zen tradition; from the account, mentioned above, of Bodhidharma’s interview with his four disciples (see Note 3, “Making a bow and standing there”).

“The bamboo truncheon and staff” (*shippei shujō* 竹篋拄杖): Two insignia of the Chan master. The *shippei* is a short rod carried by the master; the *shujō* is a ceremonial walking stick.

“Columns and lanterns” (*rochū tōrō* 露柱燈籠): An expression, fairly common in Chan texts, for the ordinary insentient things of the world around us.

“Knowledge and understanding (*chiken ge’e* 知見解會): I.e., our ordinary experience of the world; the subjective correlate to “columns and lanterns.”

9. “Those who are not like this are not students of the way.” (*shika no gotoku ni arazareba gakudō in arazu* しかのごとくにあらざれば學道にあらず): Or “If it is not like this, it is not the study of the way.”

10. “Therefore, [Dahui’s] ‘attaining the way’ does not attain the way; when it does not attain the way, it is not that it does not attain the way.” (*tokudō no tokudō sezu futokudō no toki futokudō narazaru* 得道の得道せず不得道のとき不得道ならざる): The subject of the second clause is unexpressed here. The translation treats it as Dahui’s words, “attain the way,” but it may also be understood as Dahui himself or perhaps as “those who are not like this” from the preceding sentence. In any case, the passage is generally interpreted to mean that Dahui’s sense of “attaining the way” is not really attaining the way; similarly, what he thinks of as not attaining the way is not in fact not attaining the way.

“As you say” (*nanji ga iu ga gotoku* なんぢがいふがごとく): I.e., as Dahui has said above. As is common in Zen comments, Dōgen is here directly addressing the person he is quoting. The translation continues the use of the second person throughout the passage, though the grammatical subject is unexpressed and could as well be read as “he” (i.e., Dahui).

“A part expressing the talking of the mind” (*shin no setsu arashimuru bun* 心の説あらしむる分); “a part forming the discussion of discussing of the dark” (*dan gen no dan narashimuru bun* 談玄の談ならしむる分): The particle *no* in both these phrases is ambiguous. It is possible to interpret *shin no setsu* either as “talking about the mind” or as “the mind’s talking”; similarly, it possible to interpret *dan gen no dan* either as “the discussion that is discussing the dark” or as “discussing the dark’s discussion.”

11. “Pivot” (*kanreisu* 関楔子): A common Zen idiom referring to the pivots at the top and bottom of a door frame on which the door turns; hence, the pivotal point of something. The text repeats the term just below in the expression “higher pivot.”

“Leaving the hand” (*te o hanarenzuru* 手をはなれんずる); “escaping the body” (*mi o nogarenuru* 身にのがれぬる): Both phrases expressing the abandonment of something.

“The confines of the Small Vehicle” (*shōjō no kyokuryō* 小乗の局量): Like many Mahāyāna authors, Dōgen often associates the Hīnayāna with the negation of, or urge to escape from, the phenomenal world. Note the three-tiered hierarchy here, common in his writings, of Small Vehicle, Great Vehicle, and the Chan tradition of the buddhas and ancestors.

“Innermost darkness” (*okugen* 奥玄): A somewhat unusual term, no doubt introduced here to pick up the “darkness” (*gen*) of the “dark and subtle” (*genmyō*) above. *Oku* connotes the “interior” of a structure; hence, what is “hidden” from public view, what is “remote.”

“The tea and rice of the buddhas and ancestors” (*busso no sahan* 佛祖の茶飯): I.e., the “fare” provided by the buddhas and ancestors. The term is a fairly common one in Dōgen’s writings and in Chinese Chan texts, especially in the context of words attributed to Fuyung Daokai 芙蓉道楷 (1043-1118), “The words of the buddhas and ancestors are like family style tea and rice” (*fōzu yenju ru jiazhang chafan* 佛祖言句如家常茶飯).

12. “Investigate physically” (*taikyū su* 體究す): The element *tai* can refer both to the physical body and to the essence, or substance, of something; hence *taikyū* may refer either to “getting at the substance [of a matter]” or to “making [a skill] one’s own.” The clumsy translation seeks to retain Dōgen’s play here with notions of the body in his subsequent “before the body and after the body (*shinsen shingo* 身先身後).”

13. A story found in several texts; see, e.g., *Zongmen tongyao ji* 34 verso. Also quoted by Dahui, which may explain its presence here; see *Dahui yulu* 大慧語錄 28 (T.47:925b17ff). The protagonists are, of course, Bodhidharma (“the First Ancestor”) and his disciple Huike (“the Second Ancestor”).

“Without panting” (*mutan* 無喘): Or “without busyness.” The English loses what may be a play in the Chinese with the graph *xi* 息, translated here as “put a stop to” but also meaning “breath.”

“Verify and accord” (*shōkai* 証契): See above, Note 6. The Chinese versions of the story use only the verb *qi* 契).

“Severance and extinction” (*danmetsu* 斷滅): A term typically understood as indicating a spiritually undesirable state; sometimes associated with the “extinctionist” position (*danken* 斷見; Sanskrit *uccheda-vāda*) that denies the law of cause and effect.

14. “Those who doubt” (*gijaku suru mono* 疑著するもの); “those who take it up” (*konen suru* 舉拈する): To “doubt” may refer either to “being suspicious of” or to “wondering about.” To “take up” refers to “taking as a topic for study or comment.”

15. “Thought of bodhi” (*bodai shin* 菩提心): I.e., the bodhisattva’s aspiration for supreme, perfect enlightenment.

“Whether from a friend, whether from a scripture” (*waku jū chishiki waku jū kyōkan* 或從知識或從經卷): Dōgen here shifts to Chinese, as if quoting a text. A “friend” (*chishiki*) is a common term for a Buddhist teacher.

“One maturation” (*ichirō* 一老): *Rō* is usually taken here as *rōren* 老練 (“mature,” “veteran”).

16. “That this passage and obstruction is reasonable” (*kono tsūsoku no dōri naru koto* この通塞の道理なること): “Reasonable” here translates *dōri*, elsewhere rendered as “principle,” “truth.” For the idiom, “passage and obstruction,” see above, Note 5.

17. “True enlightenment” (*shōgaku* 正覺): A standard term for the attainment of buddhahood, used to translate Sanskrit *sambodhi*.

“A thousand *ri*” (*sen ri* 千里): A *ri* (Chinese *li*) is a unit of distance, often figured as one-third of a mile, the actual length of which has varied according to time and place.

18. “Direct [approach] of the way of the buddha” (*butsudō no shōjiki* 佛道の正直): A loose translation of a somewhat odd locution; the term *shōjiki* would normally function as a modifier (“direct,” “directly,” “straightforward,” etc.).

“Mr. Gao” (*Kakō* 杲公): “Mr.” translates *kō*, an honorific not normally applied to a Zen master; here probably carries a certain ironic tone.

19. “The Eminent Ancestor, the Great Master Wuben” (*Kōso Gohon Daishi* 高祖悟本大師): I.e., Dongshan Liangjie.

“This present episode” (*ima no innen* いまの因縁): Literally, “causes and conditions,” the term *innen* is regularly in Zen texts to indicate a story, or

“old case” (*kosoku* 古則), or koan. The reference is to the Dongshan story with which this piece began; Dōgen now proceeds to a line-by-line Japanese translation and comment on the story.

20. “Not something other traditions have seen even in their dreams” (*yomon no yume ni mo kenmon seru tokoro ni arazu* 餘門の夢にも見聞せるところにあらず): I.e., something others have never dreamed of; a Japanese rendering of a standard Chan insult often used by Dōgen in its Chinese form, *mu ya mikenzai* 夢也未見在. “Other traditions” (*yomon*) presumably refers to those outside the Caodong (Sōtō) lineage of Dongshan.

21. “Inside or surface” (*waku ri waku men* 或裏或面): Dōgen is here playing with the two elements of the binome *rimen* 裏面; see Note 1, “inside,” above. Presumably, he is thereby calling into question any assumption that the “someone” is only “inside.”

“There’s someone and someone’s there” (*unin nin’u* 有人人有): Dōgen is simply reversing the order of subject and predicate in Dongshan’s phrase, “there’s someone.”

“Within the surface, the mind is talking; within the surface, the nature is talking.” (*menri shin setsu menri shō setsu* 面裏心説面裏性説): Here, Dōgen reverses the syntax of all three binomes: *rimen* (“inside”), *sesshin* (“talking of the mind”) and *sesshō* (“talking of the nature”).

22. “Other ways” (*gedō* 外道): I.e., non-Buddhist, or heterodox, religious traditions; Sanskrit *tīrthika*.

23. “Talking of the mind has not reached the field” (*sesshin mitō denchi* 説心未到田地): Usually interpreted to mean that, [unless one understands “no one” talking of the mind,] one has not yet understood “talking of the mind.” The agricultural term *denchi* (“paddy field”) is often used in Chan texts for a realm of discourse or state of mind.

“No one who talks of the mind” (*sesshin munin* 説心無人; “no one talking of the mind” (*munin sesshin* 無人説心): Tentative translations of phrases that could be parsed in several other ways: e.g., “talking of the mind is without anyone,” “there is no one who talks of the mind,” etc.

24. “The true person without rank” (*mui shinnin* 無位真人): A famous saying by Linji Yixuan 臨濟義玄 (d. 867), founder of the Linji house of Chan (of which Dahui was member). See *Linji lu* 臨濟録, T.47:496c.

“He has not reached the ground of penetration” (*mitō santetsu chi* 未到参徹地): A phrase that picks up the expression “has not reached the field” in the preceding paragraph. The English “ground” here tries to capture something of the semantic functions of the term *chi*, which reminds the reader both of the earlier “field” (*denchi*) and of the “grounds,” or “ranks” (*chi*, Sanskrit *bhūmi*), of the Buddhist path that Linji is dismissing.

“We meet them in the ear, we meet them in the eye” (*nisho ni shōken shi gensho ni shōken su* 耳處に相見し眼處に相見す): Or “we see them where we hear, we see them where we see.” The terms *nisho* (Sanskrit *śrotāyatana*) and *gensho* (Sanskrit *cakṣurāyatana*) are used in technical Buddhist vocabulary respectively for the auditory and visual sense fields.

25. “When he expresses this saying” (*kono dōshu o genjō seshimuru ni* この道取を現成せしむるに): Or “when this saying is brought to realization.” The verb in the original is a causative, the agent of which is unexpressed; it could be understood either as “we” or as “he.”

“Previously avail himself” (*saki ni mo . . . jōzu* さきにも . . . 乗ず), “subsequently avail himself” (*nochi ni mo . . . jōzu* のちにも . . . 乗ず): This could be interpreted to mean simply that, in the story, Sengmi asks the question twice; but commentators regularly take it to suggest that the question is a timeless one.

“That inside” (*nari* 那裏): The translation struggles to capture something of the apparent play here with the term *nari* (“there,” “over there”), which

includes the element *ri* of Dongshan's "inside" (*menri*); hence, the suggestion that Sengmi's question is itself what is being talked about there in the cloister. Some would interpret *nari* here to be an oblique reference to the "teaching of the mind and teaching of the nature" that is "over there," beyond a conventional meaning.

"Those of other quarters" (*yohō no tomogara* 餘方のともがら): A term of ambiguous reference; presumably, those (like Dahui and Linji) in other Chan traditions.

"Recognize the thief as their son" (*zoku o ninjite ko to su* 賊を認じて子とす): Dōgen's vernacular rendering of a common Zen saying (*ren zei wei ji* 認賊爲子), used to describe an egregious error; usually traced to the *Lengyan jing* 楞嚴經 (**Śurangama-sūtra*).

26. "Dead words" (*shiku* 死句): A standard expression for empty, ineffective language. Dōgen is, of course, playing with the term *shi*, translated in Dongshan's remark as "doomed." To retain something of this play, one might treat *shiku* here not only as "dead words" but as "deadly words."

"Doomed a hundred percent" (*jūbun no kyoshi* 十分の去死), "doomed is a hundred percent" (*kyoshi no jūbun* 去死の十分): Dōgen is here playing with Dongshan's expression, *kyoshi jūbun* ("completely doomed"). See Note 1, "doomed," above.

"Shielding the heavens and covering the earth" (*shaten gaichi* 遮天蓋地): Generally interpreted to mean "all inclusive."

27. "Zhang's third" (*Chō san* 張三); "Li's fourth" (*Li shi* 李四): From the Chinese idiom *Zhang san Li si* 張三李四 ("Zhang's third son, Li's fourth son"), used (as we might use "Tom, Dick, and Harry") to indicate anyone at all. The sentence is usually interpreted to mean simply that Sengmi is asking twice about the same person.

28. A sentence difficult to parse, for which there are varied readings. The translation follows Terada (*Dōgen* 2, p. 23n) in taking the final negative to govern both clauses. However the sentence is read, the point seems to be that we should not think that “in death” refers to the same state as “doomed,” or that “who is it?” refers to the one who is “talking of the mind and talking of the nature.”

29. “Arranges the “someone” (*unin o sahai su* 有人を差排す): Taken to mean that the question “who is it?” refers to an array of “someones.”

“He does not wait forever” (*banki sezu* 萬期せず): Literally, “does not have ten thousand expectations.” Usually understood to mean, “is already always [a hundred percent doomed].”

“True at the head and true at the tail” (*zushin bishin* 頭正尾正): Or “true from head to tail”; a fairly common expression meaning “throughout,” “entirely.”

This is perhaps the most difficult passage of the text. One possible paraphrase of its “argument” might look like this.

The death in Dongshan’s statement, “in death,” does not refer simply to the state he calls “doomed,” just as Sengmi’s “who is it” does not refer simply to a person “talking of the mind and talking of the nature.” Rather, the question “who is it?” refers to the array of phenomena that are all “talking of the mind and talking of the nature”; and these phenomena are always “doomed,” always alive in death. They are what is occurring right before us. They are all both “doomed” and “alive”; they are all completely liberated even as they live and die.

30. “Way of life” (*kakkei* 活計): A common expression for one’s occupation or livelihood.

31. “Before the body and after the body” (*shinsen shingo* 身先身後): An expression Dōgen uses elsewhere in the *Shōbōgenzō*; perhaps here indicating “in past lives and future lives.”

32. The first year of Kangen (*Kangen gannen* 寛元元年) corresponds to 1243. Kippōji 吉峯寺 is the monastery in Echizen (present Fukui) where Dōgen resided following his departure from the capital in the summer of 1243.